

**From:** Miller, Wynne [Miller.Wynne@epa.gov]  
**Sent:** 2/1/2019 10:29:55 PM  
**To:** McNally, Robert [McNally.Robert@epa.gov]; Ellis, Frank [Ellis.Frank@epa.gov]; Jones, Russell [Jones.Russell@epa.gov]  
**CC:** Keigwin, Richard [Keigwin.Richard@epa.gov]; Messina, Edward [Messina.Edward@epa.gov]  
**Subject:** Biostimulants - Nancy Beck Request  
**Attachments:** EO 12866 rin2070-ZA21\_EO12866\_PBSGuidance-Draft\_FRdocument\_2018-10-31\_mc\_2018-12-14\_rev\_2018-12-18\_v2 tjw.docx; EO 12866 rin2070-ZA21\_EO12866review\_PBSGuidance-Draft\_2018-11-011\_rev\_mc\_2019-01-29 tjw.docx

Hi Bob, Frank and Russ,  
Biostimulants came up today on the OCSPP IO morning call. Nancy Beck would like us to finish up our responses to OMB's comments. She realizes that we have comments from USDA and a meeting with DOJ in Feb; however, she would still like us to get back to OMB on their comments. TJ gave his input on the economics portion today so BEAD is done. Not sure if BPPD had anything else to do on the responses but can BPPD tidy these up, send them to Rick early next week so he can review before you send to RCS?  
Thx so much,  
Wynne

---

**From:** Wyatt, TJ  
**Sent:** Friday, February 01, 2019 12:17 PM  
**To:** Chun, Melissa <Chun.Melissa@epa.gov>; Jones, Russell <Jones.Russell@epa.gov>; McNally, Robert <McNally.Robert@epa.gov>; Varco, Joseph <varco.joseph@epa.gov>; Gsell, Alyssa <Gsell.Alyssa@epa.gov>; Kaczmarek, Chris <Kaczmarek.Chris@epa.gov>; Ambrosino, Helene <Ambrosino.Helene@epa.gov>; VanAkkeren, Brett <VanAkkeren.Brett@epa.gov>; Hofmann, Angela <Hofmann.Angela@epa.gov>; Chumble, Prasad <Chumble.Prasad@epa.gov>; Smoot, Cameo <Smoot.Cameo@epa.gov>; Watkins, Stephen <watkins.stephen@epa.gov>; Hoyt, Sarita <Hoyt.Sarita@epa.gov>; Mosby, Jackie <Mosby.Jackie@epa.gov>; Miller, Wynne <Miller.Wynne@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** Kiely, Timothy <Kiely.Timothy@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: FROM OMB: EO 12866 Interagency Review: EPA's Guidance for Plant Biostimulant Products: Label Claims Excluded or Regulated under FIFRA as Plant Regulator Claims (RIN 2070-ZA21) - Interagency Comments

Hi!

## Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

### Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

I don't have anything to contribute regarding the USDA comments, so will skip Tuesday's meeting – unless you want to discuss these comments as well.

---

**From:** Chun, Melissa  
**Sent:** Tuesday, January 29, 2019 3:23 PM  
**To:** Jones, Russell <Jones.Russell@epa.gov>; McNally, Robert <McNally.Robert@epa.gov>; Varco, Joseph <varco.joseph@epa.gov>; Gsell, Alyssa <Gsell.Alyssa@epa.gov>; Kaczmarek, Chris <Kaczmarek.Chris@epa.gov>; Ambrosino, Helene <Ambrosino.Helene@epa.gov>; VanAkkeren, Brett <VanAkkeren.Brett@epa.gov>; Wyatt, TJ <Wyatt.TJ@epa.gov>; Hofmann, Angela <Hofmann.Angela@epa.gov>; Chumble, Prasad <Chumble.Prasad@epa.gov>;

Smoot, Cameo <[Smoot.Cameo@epa.gov](mailto:Smoot.Cameo@epa.gov)>; Watkins, Stephen <[watkins.stephen@epa.gov](mailto:watkins.stephen@epa.gov)>; Hoyt, Sarita <[Hoyt.Sarita@epa.gov](mailto:Hoyt.Sarita@epa.gov)>; Mosby, Jackie <[Mosby.Jackie@epa.gov](mailto:Mosby.Jackie@epa.gov)>; Miller, Wynne <[Miller.Wynne@epa.gov](mailto:Miller.Wynne@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** FW: FROM OMB: EO 12866 Interagency Review: EPA's Guidance for Plant Biostimulant Products: Label Claims Excluded or Regulated under FIFRA as Plant Regulator Claims (RIN 2070-ZA21) - Interagency Comments

Hi all,

Welcome back.

Here's where we left off on biostimulants:

## Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Are folks o.k. with OMB's proposed revisions to D. What are the Potential Economic Impacts of Taking this Action? Comment [A2].

## Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

The Guidance document still needs work.

Please review and provide your comments on the FR document and guidance document.

We'll need to get our responses back to OMB.

I'll check with Danielle about USDA's comments and rescheduling the DOJ call.

Thanks!

-Melissa

**From:** Jones, Russell

**Sent:** Wednesday, December 19, 2018 7:32 AM

**To:** Chun, Melissa <[Chun.Melissa@epa.gov](mailto:Chun.Melissa@epa.gov)>; McNally, Robert <[McNally.Robert@epa.gov](mailto:McNally.Robert@epa.gov)>; Varco, Joseph <[varco.joseph@epa.gov](mailto:varco.joseph@epa.gov)>; Gsell, Alyssa <[Gsell.Alyssa@epa.gov](mailto:Gsell.Alyssa@epa.gov)>; Kaczmarek, Chris <[Kaczmarek.Chris@epa.gov](mailto:Kaczmarek.Chris@epa.gov)>; Ambrosino, Helene <[Ambrosino.Helene@epa.gov](mailto:Ambrosino.Helene@epa.gov)>; VanAkkeren, Brett <[VanAkkeren.Brett@epa.gov](mailto:VanAkkeren.Brett@epa.gov)>; Wyatt, TJ <[Wyatt.TJ@epa.gov](mailto:Wyatt.TJ@epa.gov)>; Hofmann, Angela <[Hofmann.Angela@epa.gov](mailto:Hofmann.Angela@epa.gov)>; Chumble, Prasad <[Chumble.Prasad@epa.gov](mailto:Chumble.Prasad@epa.gov)>; Smoot, Cameo <[Smoot.Cameo@epa.gov](mailto:Smoot.Cameo@epa.gov)>; Watkins, Stephen <[watkins.stephen@epa.gov](mailto:watkins.stephen@epa.gov)>; Hoyt, Sarita <[Hoyt.Sarita@epa.gov](mailto:Hoyt.Sarita@epa.gov)>; Mosby, Jackie <[Mosby.Jackie@epa.gov](mailto:Mosby.Jackie@epa.gov)>; Miller, Wynne <[Miller.Wynne@epa.gov](mailto:Miller.Wynne@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** RE: FROM OMB: EO 12866 Interagency Review: EPA's Guidance for Plant Biostimulant Products: Label Claims Excluded or Regulated under FIFRA as Plant Regulator Claims (RIN 2070-ZA21) - Interagency Comments

I am OK with the new language.

Russell S. Jones, Ph.D., Senior Scientist  
Chair, Biochemical Classification Committee  
Risk Assessment Branch  
Biopesticides & Pollution Prevention Division  
Office of Pesticide Programs  
US Environmental Protection Agency

P: 703-308-5071; F: 703-308-7026  
[jones.russell@epa.gov](mailto:jones.russell@epa.gov)

Office Location:  
One Potomac Yard  
2777 South Crystal Drive Arlington, VA 22202

Mailing Address:  
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Washington, DC 20460-0001  
<http://www.epa.gov/pesticides>



**From:** Chun, Melissa

**Sent:** Tuesday, December 18, 2018 5:39 PM

**To:** Jones, Russell <[Jones.Russell@epa.gov](mailto:Jones.Russell@epa.gov)>; McNally, Robert <[McNally.Robert@epa.gov](mailto:McNally.Robert@epa.gov)>; Varco, Joseph <[varco.joseph@epa.gov](mailto:varco.joseph@epa.gov)>; Gsell, Alyssa <[Gsell.Alyssa@epa.gov](mailto:Gsell.Alyssa@epa.gov)>; Kaczmarek, Chris <[Kaczmarek.Chris@epa.gov](mailto:Kaczmarek.Chris@epa.gov)>; Ambrosino, Helene <[Ambrosino.Helene@epa.gov](mailto:Ambrosino.Helene@epa.gov)>; VanAkkeren, Brett <[VanAkkeren.Brett@epa.gov](mailto:VanAkkeren.Brett@epa.gov)>; Wyatt, TJ <[Wyatt.TJ@epa.gov](mailto:Wyatt.TJ@epa.gov)>; Hofmann, Angela <[Hofmann.Angela@epa.gov](mailto:Hofmann.Angela@epa.gov)>; Chumble, Prasad <[Chumble.Prasad@epa.gov](mailto:Chumble.Prasad@epa.gov)>; Smoot, Cameo <[Smoot.Cameo@epa.gov](mailto:Smoot.Cameo@epa.gov)>; Watkins, Stephen <[watkins.stephen@epa.gov](mailto:watkins.stephen@epa.gov)>; Hoyt, Sarita <[Hoyt.Sarita@epa.gov](mailto:Hoyt.Sarita@epa.gov)>; Mosby, Jackie <[Mosby.Jackie@epa.gov](mailto:Mosby.Jackie@epa.gov)>; Miller, Wynne <[Miller.Wynne@epa.gov](mailto:Miller.Wynne@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** FW: FROM OMB: EO 12866 Interagency Review: EPA's Guidance for Plant Biostimulant Products: Label Claims Excluded or Regulated under FIFRA as Plant Regulator Claims (RIN 2070-ZA21) - Interagency Comments

Hi all,

## Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

## Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

I said that we were thinking about adding a sentence to the guidance document and the FR Notice along the lines of:

## Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

She is o.k. with the revised language.

-Melissa

**From:** Chun, Melissa

**Sent:** Tuesday, December 18, 2018 11:55 AM

**To:** Jones, Russell <[Jones.Russell@epa.gov](mailto:Jones.Russell@epa.gov)>; McNally, Robert <[McNally.Robert@epa.gov](mailto:McNally.Robert@epa.gov)>; Varco, Joseph <[varco.joseph@epa.gov](mailto:varco.joseph@epa.gov)>; Ambrosino, Helene <[Ambrosino.Helene@epa.gov](mailto:Ambrosino.Helene@epa.gov)>; Gsell, Alyssa <[Gsell.Alyssa@epa.gov](mailto:Gsell.Alyssa@epa.gov)>; VanAkkeren, Brett <[VanAkkeren.Brett@epa.gov](mailto:VanAkkeren.Brett@epa.gov)>; Wyatt, TJ <[Wyatt.TJ@epa.gov](mailto:Wyatt.TJ@epa.gov)>; Hofmann, Angela <[Hofmann.Angela@epa.gov](mailto:Hofmann.Angela@epa.gov)>; Chumble, Prasad <[Chumble.Prasad@epa.gov](mailto:Chumble.Prasad@epa.gov)>; Smoot, Cameo <[Smoot.Cameo@epa.gov](mailto:Smoot.Cameo@epa.gov)>; Watkins, Stephen <[watkins.stephen@epa.gov](mailto:watkins.stephen@epa.gov)>; Hoyt, Sarita <[Hoyt.Sarita@epa.gov](mailto:Hoyt.Sarita@epa.gov)>; Mosby, Jackie <[Mosby.Jackie@epa.gov](mailto:Mosby.Jackie@epa.gov)>; Miller, Wynne <[Miller.Wynne@epa.gov](mailto:Miller.Wynne@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** FW: FROM OMB: EO 12866 Interagency Review: EPA's Guidance for Plant Biostimulant Products: Label Claims Excluded or Regulated under FIFRA as Plant Regulator Claims (RIN 2070-ZA21) - Interagency Comments

Hi all,

I talked with Danielle about the biostimulants guidance during our bi-weekly meeting this morning.

She mentioned that USDA had comments on the guidance document that they will send to her today. Danielle will get them to us as soon as she can.

## Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Please note that the call with DOJ will need to be scheduled the 1<sup>st</sup> week of January. DOJ indicated that they are available on January 3<sup>rd</sup>, 7<sup>th</sup> and 8<sup>th</sup>. Please let me know your availability (2 or more times if possible).

I'm attaching a revised version of the FR Notice.

Thanks!

-Melissa

---

**From:** Gsell, Alyssa

**Sent:** Monday, December 17, 2018 4:04 PM

**To:** Chun, Melissa <[Chun.Melissa@epa.gov](mailto:Chun.Melissa@epa.gov)>; Jones, Russell <[Jones.Russell@epa.gov](mailto:Jones.Russell@epa.gov)>; McNally, Robert <[McNally.Robert@epa.gov](mailto:McNally.Robert@epa.gov)>; Varco, Joseph <[varco.joseph@epa.gov](mailto:varco.joseph@epa.gov)>; Ambrosino, Helene <[Ambrosino.Helene@epa.gov](mailto:Ambrosino.Helene@epa.gov)>; VanAkkeren, Brett <[VanAkkeren.Brett@epa.gov](mailto:VanAkkeren.Brett@epa.gov)>; Wyatt, TJ <[Wyatt.Tj@epa.gov](mailto:Wyatt.Tj@epa.gov)>; Hofmann, Angela <[Hofmann.Angela@epa.gov](mailto:Hofmann.Angela@epa.gov)>; Chumble, Prasad <[Chumble.Prasad@epa.gov](mailto:Chumble.Prasad@epa.gov)>; Smoot, Cameo <[Smoot.Cameo@epa.gov](mailto:Smoot.Cameo@epa.gov)>; Watkins, Stephen <[watkins.stephen@epa.gov](mailto:watkins.stephen@epa.gov)>; Hoyt, Sarita <[Hoyt.Sarita@epa.gov](mailto:Hoyt.Sarita@epa.gov)>; Mosby, Jackie <[Mosby.Jackie@epa.gov](mailto:Mosby.Jackie@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** RE: FROM OMB: EO 12866 Interagency Review: EPA's Guidance for Plant Biostimulant Products: Label Claims Excluded or Regulated under FIFRA as Plant Regulator Claims (RIN 2070-ZA21) - Interagency Comments

## Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Thanks.

Alyssa M. Gsell

US EPA Office of General Counsel

Phone: 202-564-7413

Fax: 202-564-5416

---

**From:** Chun, Melissa

**Sent:** Sunday, December 16, 2018 6:49 PM

**To:** Jones, Russell <[Jones.Russell@epa.gov](mailto:Jones.Russell@epa.gov)>; McNally, Robert <[McNally.Robert@epa.gov](mailto:McNally.Robert@epa.gov)>; Varco, Joseph <[varco.joseph@epa.gov](mailto:varco.joseph@epa.gov)>; Ambrosino, Helene <[Ambrosino.Helene@epa.gov](mailto:Ambrosino.Helene@epa.gov)>; Gsell, Alyssa <[Gsell.Alyssa@epa.gov](mailto:Gsell.Alyssa@epa.gov)>; VanAkkeren, Brett <[VanAkkeren.Brett@epa.gov](mailto:VanAkkeren.Brett@epa.gov)>; Wyatt, TJ <[Wyatt.Tj@epa.gov](mailto:Wyatt.Tj@epa.gov)>; Hofmann, Angela

<Hofmann.Angela@epa.gov>; Chumble, Prasad <Chumble.Prasad@epa.gov>; Smoot, Cameo <Smoot.Cameo@epa.gov>; Watkins, Stephen <watkins.stephen@epa.gov>; Hoyt, Sarita <Hoyt.Sarita@epa.gov>; Mosby, Jackie <Mosby.Jackie@epa.gov>

**Subject:** FW: FROM OMB: EO 12866 Interagency Review: EPA's Guidance for Plant Biostimulant Products: Label Claims Excluded or Regulated under FIFRA as Plant Regulator Claims (RIN 2070-ZA21) - Interagency Comments

Hi all,

Here's the mark-up for the FR Notice.

## Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Please forward your comments to everyone on this e-mail.

Thanks!

-Melissa

---

**From:** Chun, Melissa

**Sent:** Friday, December 14, 2018 12:08 PM

**To:** Jones, Russell <Jones.Russell@epa.gov>; McNally, Robert <McNally.Robert@epa.gov>; Varco, Joseph <varco.joseph@epa.gov>; Ambrosino, Helene <Ambrosino.Helene@epa.gov>; Gsell, Alyssa <Gsell.Alyssa@epa.gov>; VanAkkeren, Brett <VanAkkeren.Brett@epa.gov>; Hofmann, Angela <Hofmann.Angela@epa.gov>; Chumble, Prasad <Chumble.Prasad@epa.gov>; Smoot, Cameo <Smoot.Cameo@epa.gov>; Watkins, Stephen <watkins.stephen@epa.gov>; Hoyt, Sarita <Hoyt.Sarita@epa.gov>; Mosby, Jackie <Mosby.Jackie@epa.gov>

**Subject:** FW: FROM OMB: EO 12866 Interagency Review: EPA's Guidance for Plant Biostimulant Products: Label Claims Excluded or Regulated under FIFRA as Plant Regulator Claims (RIN 2070-ZA21) - Interagency Comments

We walked through the comments, made assignments, and flagged one that will need to be raised to the DAA's.

## Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP) for help

We'll send the mark-ups around on Monday for folks to comment on.

## Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

After we've agreed on the responses/edits, the documents will go to Rick and the DAA's on Tuesday for their approval, before sending the responses to OMB.

Please note that there might be a second set of comments from USDA next Tuesday.

Thanks everyone!

-Melissa

**Melissa L Chun** | US EPA | Regulatory and Information Coordination Staff | Office of Chemical Safety and Pollution Prevention | 1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW | William Jefferson Clinton Building East Room 3425E, Mail Code 7101M | Washington DC 20460 | phone: (202) 564-1605

---

**From:** Chun, Melissa

**Sent:** Friday, December 14, 2018 9:35 AM

**To:** Jones, Russell <[Jones.Russell@epa.gov](mailto:Jones.Russell@epa.gov)>; McNally, Robert <[McNally.Robert@epa.gov](mailto:McNally.Robert@epa.gov)>; Varco, Joseph <[varco.joseph@epa.gov](mailto:varco.joseph@epa.gov)>; Ambrosino, Helene <[Ambrosino.Helene@epa.gov](mailto:Ambrosino.Helene@epa.gov)>; Gsell, Alyssa <[Gsell.Alyssa@epa.gov](mailto:Gsell.Alyssa@epa.gov)>; VanAkkeren, Brett <[VanAkkeren.Brett@epa.gov](mailto:VanAkkeren.Brett@epa.gov)>; Hofmann, Angela <[Hofmann.Angela@epa.gov](mailto:Hofmann.Angela@epa.gov)>; Chumble, Prasad <[Chumble.Prasad@epa.gov](mailto:Chumble.Prasad@epa.gov)>; Smoot, Cameo <[Smoot.Cameo@epa.gov](mailto:Smoot.Cameo@epa.gov)>; Watkins, Stephen <[watkins.stephen@epa.gov](mailto:watkins.stephen@epa.gov)>; Hoyt, Sarita <[Hoyt.Sarita@epa.gov](mailto:Hoyt.Sarita@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** FROM OMB: EO 12866 Interagency Review: EPA's Guidance for Plant Biostimulant Products: Label Claims Excluded or Regulated under FIFRA as Plant Regulator Claims (RIN 2070-ZA21) - Interagency Comments

Hi all,

Here are the interagency reviewer comments from OMB.

We go through them at 11 am.

-Melissa

**Melissa L Chun** | US EPA | Regulatory and Information Coordination Staff | Office of Chemical Safety and Pollution Prevention | 1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW | William Jefferson Clinton Building East Room 3425E, Mail Code 7101M | Washington DC 20460 | phone: (202) 564-1605

---

**From:** Jones, Danielle Y. EOP/OMB <[Danielle\\_Y\\_Jones@omb.eop.gov](mailto:Danielle_Y_Jones@omb.eop.gov)>

**Sent:** Friday, December 14, 2018 9:29 AM

**To:** Chun, Melissa <[Chun.Melissa@epa.gov](mailto:Chun.Melissa@epa.gov)>

**Cc:** Hofmann, Angela <[Hofmann.Angela@epa.gov](mailto:Hofmann.Angela@epa.gov)>; VanAkkeren, Brett <[VanAkkeren.Brett@epa.gov](mailto:VanAkkeren.Brett@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** EO 12866 Interagency Review: EPA's Guidance for Plant Biostimulant Products: Label Claims Excluded or Regulated under FIFRA as Plant Regulator Claims (RIN 2070-ZA21)

Good morning Melissa,

Please find attached the interagency reviewers comments on the Guidance for Plant Biostimulant Products: Label Claims Excluded or Regulated under FIFRA as Plant Regulator Claims (RIN 2070-ZA21).

Please let me know if you have any questions.

Best,  
Danielle

Danielle Y. Jones  
Senior Policy Analyst  
Office of Management and Budget  
Phone: (202) 395-1741 | [djones@omb.eop.gov](mailto:djones@omb.eop.gov)